LEGAL GROUNDS

Reproductive and Sexual Rights in Sub-Saharan African Courts

Volume III







Reproductive and sexual rights, which are guaranteed in constitutions and in international and regional human rights treaties, have no impact if they are not recognized and enforced by national-level courts. *Legal Grounds: Sexual and Reproductive Rights in Sub-Saharan African Courts* Volume III continues to provide much-needed information about whether and how national courts of African countries apply human rights laws in decisions that affect the rights of women and others. The case summaries and thematic highlights can be useful resources for advocates seeking to further develop litigation, advocacy, and capacity building strategies.

A JOINT PUBLICATION OF:

Center for Reproductive Rights

199 Water Street New York, New York 10038

Tel 917 637 3600 Fax 917 637 3666 info@reprorights.org www.reproductiverights.org

The Center for Reproductive Rights uses the law to advance reproductive freedom as a fundamental right that all governments are obligated to protect, respect, and fulfill.

International Reproductive and Sexual Health Law Program

Faculty of Law, University of Toronto 78 Queen's Park Cr.
Toronto, Ontario M5S 2C5, Canada

Tel 416 978 1751 Fax 416 978 7899 Reprohealth.law@utoronto.ca www.law.utoronto.ca/programs/ reprohealth.html

Centre for Human Rights

Faculty of Law University of Pretoria South Africa 0002

Tel +27 (0) 12 420 3810 Fax +27 (0) 86 580 5743 chr@up.ac.za www.chr.up.ac.za

LEGAL GROSS

Reproductive and Sexual Rights in Sub-Saharan African Courts

Volume III

2017

Legal Grounds III: Reproductive and Sexual Rights in Sub-Saharan African Courts

Published by:

Pretoria University Law Press (PULP)

The Pretoria University Law Press (PULP) is a publisher at the Faculty of Law, University of Pretoria, South Africa. PULP endeavours to publish and make available innovative, high-quality scholarly texts on law in Africa. PULP also publishes a series of collections of legal documents related to public law in Africa, as well as text books from African countries other than South Africa. This book was peer reviewed prior to publication.

For more information on PULP, see www.pulp.up.ac.za

Printed and bound by:

BusinessPrint, Pretoria

To order, contact:

PULP

Faculty of Law, University of Pretoria South Africa 0002

Tel: +27 12 420 4948

Fax: +27 86 610 6668

pulp@up.ac.za www.pulp.up.ac.za

ISBN: 978-1-920538-63-7

Electronic copies of this book are online at:

Pretoria University Law Press (PULP)

www.pulp.up.ac.za/legal-compilations/legal-grounds

Center for Reproductive Rights

http://www.reproductiverights.org/legalgrounds

International Reproductive and Sexual Health Law Program

www.law.utoronto.ca/programs/legalgrounds.html

Centre for Human Rights, University of Pretoria

www.chr.up.ac.za

© 2017 Center for Reproductive Rights, the International Reproductive and Sexual Health Law Program at the University of Toronto, and the Centre for Human Rights at the University of Pretoria. Any part of this report may be copied, translated, or adapted with permission from the authors, provided that the parts copied are distributed free or at cost (not for profit) and the Center for Reproductive Rights, the International Reproductive and Sexual Health Law Program at the University of Toronto, and the Centre for Human Rights at the University of Pretoria are acknowledged as the authors. Any commercial reproduction requires prior written permission from the Center, the University of Toronto, or the Center for Human Rights at the University of Pretoria. The Center for Reproductive Rights would appreciate receiving a copy of any materials in which information from this report is used.



This work is licensed under the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International (CC BY 4.0) License.

To view a copy of the license, visit https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/legalcode.

Center for Reproductive Rights

199 Water Street New York, NY 10038

Tel 917 637 3600 **Fax** 917 637 3666 info@reprorights.org www.reproductiverights.org

International Reproductive and Sexual Health Law Program

Faculty of Law, University of Toronto 78 Queen's Park Cr.
Toronto, Ontario M5S 2C5, Canada

Tel 416 978 1751 **Fax** 416 978 7899 reprohealth.law@utoronto.ca www.law.utoronto.ca/programs/ reprohealth.html

Centre for Human Rights

Faculty of Law University of Pretoria South Africa 0002

Tel +27 (0) 12 420 3810 **Fax** +27 (0) 86 580 5743 chr@up.ac.za (This e-mail address is being protected from spambots. You need JavaScript enabled to view it.) www.chr.up.ac.za

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknow	rledgments	10
Table o	f Cases by Country	13
Forewo	rd	16
Chapte	r One: Introduction	18
Chapte	r Two: Children and Adolescents	20
Child, Fo	rced and Early Marriage	20
0	Mudzuru & Another v. Ministry of Justice, Legal & Parliamentary Affairs (N.O.) & Others	20
0	Nvumeleni Jezile v. The State and 7 Others	
0	Highlight: Child Marriage: Legal and Socio-Cultural Aspects	28
Female G	enital Mutilation	29
0	Law and Advocacy for Women in Uganda v. The Attorney General	29
Sexual Al	ouse, Assault and Violence	33
	C.K. (A Child) through Ripples International as her guardian and Next friend) & 11 Others v. Commissioner of Police/Inspector General of The National	
0	Police Service & 3 Others	
	Highlight: Sexual Abuse, Assault and Violence	
Consensi	ual Sexual Conduct	41
0	C.K.W. v. Attorney General & Another	41
0	S v. Brian M. [surname editorially abridged]	44
0	Teddy Bear Clinic for Abused Children and Another v. Minister of Justice	4.5
0	and Constitutional Development and Another [High Court decision]	45
O	and Constitutional Development and Another [Constitutional Court decision]	49
0	Highlight: Adolescent Consensual Sexual Conduct	
Student I	Pregnancy	54
0	Head of Department, Department of Education, Free State Province v. Welkom High School & Another; Head of Department, Department of Education, Free State Province v. Harmony High School & Another	54

Chapte	er Three: Maternal Health Care and Services	57
0	Center for Health, Human Rights and Development and 3 Others v. Attorney	EO
0	General [Constitutional Court decision]	58
· ·	General [Supreme Court decision]	61
0	Center for Health, Human Rights and Development & 4 Others v. Nakaseke	
	District Local Administration	65
0	Millicent Awuor Omuya alias Maimuna Awuor & Another v. The Attorney General & 4 Others	69
0	Ntsele v. MEC for Health, Gauteng Provincial Government	
0	Highlight: Maternal Health Care and Services	
Chapte	er Four: Abortion and Fetal Interests	77
Abortion		77
0	Case no. RPA 0787/15/HC/KIG	77
0	Mildred Mapingure v. Minister of Home Affairs and 2 Others	81
0	-1	
0	Highlight: Abortion and Fetal Interests	89
Wrongfu	I Birth or Life	90
0	AAA v. Registered Trustees (Aga Khan University Hospital, Nairobi)	90
0	E.R.O. v. Board of Trustees, Family Planning Association of Kenya	93
0	H v. Fetal Assessment Centre	95
Chapte	er Five: Adoption and Surrogacy	100
Adoption	1	101
	GK v. BOK, CGLK, MT and the Attorney General	101
	Highlight: Adoption and Surrogacy	
Surroga	cy	106
0	AB and Surrogacy Advisory Group v. Minister of Social Development	106
	Ex Parte: MS and Others	
	J.L.N. & 2 Others v. Director of Children's Services & 4 Others	
0	MIA v. State Information Technology Agency (Pty) Ltd	116

Chapte	r Six: Gender, Sexuality, Women and Discrimination	119
Rape		120
0	S v. Chirembwe	120
Disabilit	y, Sexuality and Criminal Law	122
0	Center for Health, Human Rights and Development and Iga Daniel v. Attorney General	
Women a	and Criminal Law	125
0	T 01 1 10 11 10 11 10 11 10 11 10 11 10 11 10 11 10 11 10 11 11	
O	& 2 Others	125
Legal Re	ecognition of Intersexuality	129
0	v. Attorney General, Kenyatta National Hospital, and the Registrar of Births	
0	and Deaths	
Gender I	dentity	138
0	Republic v. Kenya National Examinations Council & Another	138
Sexual C	Orientation	140
	Oloka-Onyango and 9 Others v. Attorney General	
Recogni	tion of LGBTIQ Advocacy and Groups	144
0		
0	Thuto Rammoge & 19 Others v. The Attorney General of Botswana	
0	Attorney General of Botswana v. Thuto Rammoge & 19 Others The People v. Paul Kasonkomona	
0	Republic v. Non-Governmental Organizations Co-ordination Board & Another	155
	ex-parte Transgender Education and Advocacy & 3 Others	157
0	Highlight: Towards Respect for Human Diversity	160
Chapte	r Seven: HIV	161
Access t	o Treatment	162
0	Dr. Jeremiah Ojonemi Alabi Abalaka and Medicrest Specialist Hospital Ltd. v. President of the Federal Republic of Nigeria, Attorney General of the Federation, and National Agency for Food and Drug Administration and Control (NAFDAC)	
	Dickson Tanela & 2 Others v. Attorney General & 2 Others	16/

0	Attorney General and Others v. Tapela and Others; In re: Attorney General and Others	
0	v. Mwale	
	·	
	isation of Transmission	
	AIDS Law Project v. Attorney General & 3 Others	
	Rosemary Namubiru v. Uganda Highlight: Criminalisation of HIV Non-Disclosure, Exposure, and Transmission	
	rerilization	
	LM and Others v. Government of the Republic of Namibia	
	Government of the Republic of Namibia v. L.M. & 2 Others	
	Highlight: Sexual and Reproductive Rights of Women Living with HIV	
Discrimir	nation in Employment	187
0	Dwenga and Others v. Surgeon-General of the South African Military Health	
	Services and Others	
0	Gary Shane Allpass v. Mooikloof Estates (Pty) Ltd	
0	Georgina Ahamefule v. Imperial Medical Centre & Dr. Alex Molokwu	
0	Stanley Kingaipe & Another v. The Attorney General	134
Chapte	r Eight: Francophone Africa	197
Adultery	I Decision DCC 09-081	198
Polygamy	/ Decision DCC 02-144	200
Infanticio	Infanticide Judgment No 216	
Chapitr	e Huit: L'Afrique Francophone	204
_	e Décision DCC 09-081	
	La polygamie Décision DCC 02-144	
L'infantio	side Judgment No 216	209
Online L	Legal Resources	212
Full Citation Information and Case Links		214
Endnote	Endnotes	

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Legal Grounds III: Reproductive and Sexual Rights in Sub-Saharan African Courts is a joint publication of the International Reproductive and Sexual Health Law Program of the University of Toronto, Canada; the Centre for Human Rights, Faculty of Law, at the University of Pretoria, South Africa; and the Center for Reproductive Rights, New York. It is the expanded third volume in a series originally conceived by Kibrom Isaak, LL.M., a graduate of the International Reproductive and Sexual Health Law Program, who organised and wrote the prototype, and drafted most of the first two volumes.

The editors of *Legal Grounds III* are tremendously grateful to all those who have supported us to produce this book. The planning and execution would not have been possible without a grant from the Ford Foundation. African publication and dissemination were generously supported, through the Centre for Human Rights, by The Open Society Foundations.

The Chief-Editor of Volume III is Godfrey Dalitso Kangaude BPhil (PUU), LL.B Hons (Mw), LL.M (UFS), LL.M (UCLA), Director of Nyale Institute for Sexual and Reproductive Health Governance, now a Doctor of Laws candidate at the University of Pretoria. He coordinated the identification and collation of materials, drafting and editing of case summaries, and provided editorial support to the other contributors to the project.

Throughout the drafting process, *Legal Grounds III* benefited from the invaluable input, feedback, and support of Professors Rebecca Cook and Bernard Dickens, Co-Directors of the International Reproductive and Sexual Health Law Program, and Professor Charles Ngwena, Co-coordinator of the LL.M/M.Phil Program in Sexual & Reproductive Rights in Africa of the Centre for Human Rights, Faculty of Law, at the University of Pretoria, South Africa. Linda Hutjens, Ph.D., Coordinator at the International Reproductive and Sexual Health Law Program, managed and provided critical support with the book's drafting and editing.

Special thanks go to Onyema Afulukwe, LL.M., Senior Legal Adviser for Africa at the Center for Reproductive Rights, and a graduate of the International Reproductive and Sexual Health Law Program, University of Toronto, who authored the general introduction, one case summary, and one highlight. She also managed a diverse team of pro bono lawyers and associates from the public-spirited law firm of Weil, Gotshal & Manges, LLP, from which we specifically thank Amanda Do Couto, Dena Medford, Katherine Meister, Daniel Musher, Alex Purtill, Gemma Sage, Pan Vang, and Dana Watts for summarizing an additional fourteen decisions for our editor. For overseeing the review, editing and proofreading of all of the case summaries, we are most grateful to the senior lawyers of Weil, Gotshal & Manges, LLP, Annemargaret Connolly and Thomas Goslin; and Onyema Afulukwe, the final reviewer of the case summaries, introductions and highlights.

Of the fifty-four cases summarised in this volume, thirteen were kindly drafted by students who enrolled in the LL.M./M.Phil program on Sexual and Reproductive Rights in Africa at the University of Pretoria's Centre for Human Rights in 2014: Rudo Chigudu, Yumba Kakhobwe, Martha Nambuyaga, Nthabiseng Lelisa, Phiwo Nyobo, Keikantse Phele, Dominic Rono, Mobby Rusere, Annagrace Rwehumbiza, Winnet Shamuyarira, and Phillipa Tucker. We thank them for their helpful contributions.

We are particularly grateful to Guy-Fleury Ntwari, Ph.D in Law, Senior Researcher and Lecturer of Law at the Faculté du Droit, Université Jean Moulin (Lyon 3) in France, who, learning about the project just a few months before submission, kindly authored the Francophone chapter and expanded our Francophone bibliography. For assistance in his efforts to trace decisions from Francophone Africa, we would like to thank Dr. Gérard Aivo from Bénin, Alice Nkom from Cameroon, Orquidea Massarango from Mozambique, and Eduardo Kapapelo from Angola.

For writing expert introductions and highlight comments, we would like to express our deep appreciation of the following contributors:

Ebenezer Durojaye, Dullah Omar Institute, University of the Western Cape, for "HIV" and "Sexual and Reproductive Rights of Women Living with HIV;"

Godfrey Kangaude, for "Children and Adolescents," "Child Marriage: Legal and Socio-Cultural Aspects," "Adolescent consensual sexual conduct," and "Towards Respect for Human Diversity;"

Jacinta Nyachae, Executive Director of the AIDS Law Project, for "Criminalisation of HIV Non-Disclosure, Exposure, and Transmission;"

MaryFrances Lukera, Ph.D. candidate, University of Sussex, for "Gender, Sexuality, Women and Discrimination:"

Onyema Afulukwe, Senior Legal Adviser for Africa, Center for Reproductive Rights, for "Abortion and Fetal Interests;"

Ronaldah Lerato Karabo Ozah, Attorney, Centre for Child Law, University of Pretoria, for "Adoption and Surrogacy;"

Tinyade Kachika, Consultant on women's human rights, for "Maternal Health Care and Services;" and

Victoria Balogun, School of Law, University of Kwazulu-Natal, for "Sexual Abuse, Assault and Violence toward Adolescents."

For assistance in obtaining copies of hard-to-find Anglophone decisions, we are particularly grateful to Ebenezer Durojaye, Yinka Owoeye, Seth Earn, Neela Ghoshal, Eric Gitari, Elin Martinez, William Ndengeyinka, Camilla Pickles, and the valiant case-collectors at the Gender Justice Observatory of Women's Link Worldwide.

For assistance in finding appropriate specialists to author certain sections, we appreciate the help of Camilla Pickles, Frans Viljoen, and Godfrey Kangaude.

For excellent research assistance, we sincerely thank certain law students from the University of Toronto's Faculty of Law: Jainita Gajjar for finding and charting appropriate cases; Michelle Hayman for the Anglophone bibliography; Shalu Atwal for the Francophone bibliography; and Suzanne Zaccour, an LL.M. candidate, for expertly proofreading the Francophone chapter, translating it for English readers, and finalizing case citations. For proofreading all of the English case summaries, we sincerely thank Kerry Burns.

Special thanks to Lilian Sepúlveda, Vice President, Global Legal Program, at the Center for Reproductive Rights, for her invaluable support and Katy Mayall, Senior Manager, Global Legal Program, for her review and editorial comments. Special thanks also to Chi Nguyen, Senior Designer at the Center, for laying out the report, and Yara Calcaño, Legal Assistant in the Global Legal Program for supporting the layout process.

Finally, we are most grateful to Professors Charles Ngwena and Frans Viljoen of the Centre for Human Rights at University of Pretoria, Lizette Herman of the Pretoria University Law Press (PULP), and Yolanda Booyzen of AFRICLAW for their crucial roles in producing and disseminating the print and electronic editions of this publication in the African region.

*The views and opinions expressed in this book are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the official policy or position of the Center for Reproductive Rights, The International Reproductive and Sexual Health Law Program, the University of Toronto's Faculty of Law, nor the Centre for Human Rights at the University of Pretoria.

TABLE OF CASES BY COUNTRY

BENIN

Decision DCC 09-081 Decision DCC 02-144	
BOTSWANA	
Attorney General of Botswana v. Thuto Rammoge & 19 Others	151
Attorney General and Others v. Tapela and Others; In re: Attorney General and Others	
v. Mwale	165
Dickson Tapela & 2 Others v. Attorney General & 2 Others	164
GK v. BOK, CGLK, MT and the Attorney General	101
Thuto Rammoge & 19 Others v. The Attorney General of Botswana	147
KENYA	
AAA v. Registered Trustees (Aga Khan University Hospital, Nairobi)	90
AIDS Law Project v. Attorney General & 3 Others	
Baby "A" (suing through her mother, E.A.) and The Cradle the Children Foundation	
v. Attorney General, Kenyatta National Hospital, and the Registrar of Births and Deaths	129
C.K. (A Child) through Ripples International as her guardian and next friend) & 11 Others	
v. Commissioner of Police/Inspector General of The National Police Service & 3 Others	33
C.K.W. v. Attorney General & Another	41
C.O.L. & G.M.N. v. Resident Magistrate Kwale Court & Others	142
Eric Gitari v. Non-Governmental Organizations Co-Ordination Board & 4 Others	144
E.R.O. v. Board of Trustees, Family Planning Association of Kenya	93
J.L.N. & 2 Others v. Director of Children's Services & 4 Others	113
Lucy Nyambura & Another v. Town Clerk, Municipal Council of Mombasa & 2 Others	125
Millicent Awuor Omuya alias Maimuna Awuor & Another v. The Attorney General	
& 4 Others	69
P.A.O. and 2 Others v. The Attorney General & Another	167
Republic v. Jackson Namunya Tali	86
Republic v. Kenya National Examinations Council & Another	138
Republic v. Non-Governmental Organizations Co-ordination Board & another ex-parte	
Transgender Education and Advocacy & 3 Others	157
R.M. v. Attorney General & 4 Others	133
W.J. & Another v. Astarikoh Henry Amkoah & 9 Others	36

NAMIBIA LM and Others v. Government of the Republic of Namibia......181 **NIGER NIGERIA** Dr. Jeremiah Ojonemi Alabi Abalaka and Medicrest Specialist Hospital Ltd. v. President of the Federal Republic of Nigeria, Attorney General of the Federation, and National Agency for Food and Drug Administration and Control (NAFDAC)......162 Georgina Ahamefule v. Imperial Medical Centre & Dr. Alex Molokwu192 **RWANDA** Case no. RPA 0787/15/HC/KIG77 **SOUTH AFRICA** AB and Surrogacy Advisory Group v. Minister of Social Development106 Dwenga and Others v. Surgeon-General of the South African Military Health Services Head of Department, Department of Education, Free State Province v. Welkom High School & Another; Head of Department, Department of Education, Free State Province v. Harmony High School & Another......54 M I A v. State Information Technology Agency (Pty) Ltd......116 Teddy Bear Clinic for Abused Children and Another v. Minister of Justice and Constitutional Development and Another [High Court]45 Teddy Bear Clinic for Abused Children and Another v. Minister of Justice and Constitutional Development and Another [Constitutional Court]......49

UGANDA

Center for Health, Human Rights and Development and 3 Others v. Attorney General	
[Constitutional Court]	58
Center for Health, Human Rights and Development and 3 Others v. Attorney General	
[Supreme Court]	61
Center for Health, Human Rights and Development & 4 Others v. Nakaseke District	
Local Administration	65
Center for Health, Human Rights and Development and Iga Daniel v. Attorney General	122
Law and Advocacy for Women in Uganda v. The Attorney General	
Oloka-Onyango and 9 Others v. Attorney General	
Rosemary Namubiru v. Uganda	
ZAMBIA	
People v. Paul Kasonkomona	155
Stanley Kingaipe & Another v. The Attorney General	
ZIMBABWE	
Mildred Mapingure v. Minister of Home Affairs and 2 Others	81
Mudzuru & Another v. Ministry of Justice, Legal & Parliamentary Affairs (N.O.) & Others	
S v. Brian M. [surname editorially abridged]	
S v. Chirembwe	
O V. OHIIOHIDVVC	⊥∠∪